

Alternative Sentencing

Mary Lou Randour, Ph.D.

Senior Advisor, Animal Cruelty Programs and Training

Animal Welfare Institute

Marylou@awionline.org

What Doesn't Work

▶ Get tough approaches

▶ Scared Straight

Two meta-analyses found that participation in Scared Straight-type programs increases the odds that youth will commit offenses in the future.

▶ DARE

▶ Longstanding, popular program, however multiple studies showed no effect

▶ A few studies showed a negative effect

▶ In 2009 developed a new model, from Just say No! to Keepin' it REAL.

▶ Curriculum developed by violence prevention experts & curriculum developers

▶ Classroom instruction, 10 weeks, continued education over school year

Empirical information about violent offending

- ▶ Life course persistent delinquency and adolescent-limited delinquency
- ▶ Ages 18 - 29 is period when early signs of delinquency persist or desist
- ▶ 50% of children with serious conduct disorder do not develop Adult Personality Syndrome
- ▶ First appearance of violent behavior
 - ▶ before age 11 - 50% persisted
 - ▶ between 11 and 13 - 30% persisted
 - ▶ adolescence - 10% persisted
- ▶ Mental health and personality variables as risk factors
 - ▶ Hyperactive-impulsive-attention deficit combined with conduct disorder
 - ▶ Mood disorders
 - ▶ Post-traumatic stress disorder

National Institute of Justice's Crime Solutions

www.crimesolutions.gov

- ▶ CrimeSolutions.gov programs and practices are identified, screened, reviewed, and rated using a standardized process. Programs are reviewed based on evaluations and practices based on meta-analyses that synthesize different evaluations, but those evaluations have to be sufficiently rigorous. Each screened program and practice is reviewed by two certified reviewers using objective scoring instruments. Ratings are assigned based on the consensus score, which is subject to a documented dispute resolution process when necessary.

Blueprints for Healthy Youth Development

www.blueprintsprogram.org

- ▶ The Blueprints for Healthy Youth Development mission is to promote interventions that work. They provide a comprehensive, trusted registry of evidence-based interventions (programs, practices and policies) that are effective in reducing antisocial behavior and promoting a healthy course of youth development and adult maturity. They also advocate for evidence-based interventions locally and nationally and produce publications on the importance of adopting high-scientific standards when evaluating what works in social and crime prevention interventions.

How rigorous is rigorous?

▶ Crime Solutions

- ▶ Effective 19%
- ▶ Promising 61%
- ▶ No effect 20%

▶ Blueprints

- ▶ Model Plus 3.5%
- ▶ Model 15.7%
- ▶ Promising 80.8%

NIJ's Multisite Evaluation of Prosecutor-Led Diversion Programs

- ▶ Study implemented by the Center for Court Innovation, the RAND Corporation, the Association of Prosecuting Attorneys, and the Police Foundation.
- ▶ Milwaukee Diversion; Milwaukee Deferred; Chittenden County RICC; Cook County Felony Drug; Cook County misdemeanor Drug; Cook County Misdemeanor Deferred Prosecution
- ▶ Milwaukee Diversion; Cook County Felony Drug School; and Cook County Misdemeanor Deferred Prosecutions had statistically significant less arrests after two years to comparison groups ($p < .05$)

The element of success

- ▶ Programs that follow Risk-Need-Responsivity model reduce recidivism up to 35%
 - ▶ Risk: Offender treatment calibrated to level of risk
 - ▶ Need: primary address criminogenic needs-history of antisocial behavior; antisocial personality pattern; antisocial cognition; antisocial associates; family and/or marital; school and/or work; leisure and/or recreation; substance abuse
 - ▶ Responsivity - offender treatment therapies match an offender's learning style, motivation level, and cultural background
- ▶ Therapeutic treatment model
- ▶ Select tested treatment with trained staff
- ▶ Assure fidelity of intervention
 - ▶ Training
 - ▶ Manual
 - ▶ Supervision
- ▶ Separate higher risk from lower risk
- ▶ Provide services to moderate and higher risk
- ▶ Completion of program
- ▶ Longer duration

The elements of success, cont'd

- ▶ Provide services to moderate and higher risk
- ▶ Completion of program
- ▶ Longer duration
- ▶ Cognitive social learning strategies
- ▶ Group based delivery alongside individual delivery
- ▶ Treatments that incorporated role-play activities and relapse prevention
- ▶ Home work
- ▶ Interpersonal skill development
- ▶ Follow-up and follow-through after treatment completion

Meta-analysis of diversion programs for juvenile offenders

- ▶ 28 eligible studies; 57 experimental comparisons, and 19,301 youth
- ▶ Five types of programs were reviewed
 - ▶ Case management
 - ▶ Individual treatment
 - ▶ Family treatment
 - ▶ Youth court
 - ▶ Restorative Justice
- ▶ **Only family treatment produced statistically significant reduction in recidivism**
- ▶ Restorative justice also produced significant reductions in recidivism when researchers were involved

NIJ Findings

- ▶ Of the NIJ study of 15 programs, only four used a formal, validated tool.
- ▶ Milwaukee was a unique model among all programs examined adopting a rigorous protocol for risk informed decision making
 - ▶ Short form LSI-R:SV
 - ▶ Defendants scoring medium or high risk given full length LSI-R
 - ▶ Medium risk routed to Deferred Prosecution
 - ▶ High risk ineligible
- ▶ Few programs used evidenced-based cognitive behavior therapy although some were beginning to adopt; instead, educational classes predominated
- ▶ Only four programs used restorative justice models

Don't reinvent the wheel: Examples of successful programs and practices-Juveniles

- ▶ Big Brothers, Big Sisters
- ▶ Functional Family Therapy
- ▶ Juveniles Breaking the Cycle Program (Lane County, Oregon)
- ▶ Mentoring
- ▶ Multisystemic Therapy
- ▶ Police Diversion
- ▶ Treatment in Secure Corrections for Serious Juvenile Offenders

Examples of effect programs for adult offenders

- ▶ Alleghany County (Penn) Jail-Based Reentry Specialist Program
- ▶ Cook County Misdemeanor Deferred Prosecution
- ▶ Enhanced Thinking Skills
- ▶ Milwaukee Diversion Program
- ▶ Reduced Probation Caseload in Evidence-Based Setting (Iowa)

Don't I need a program that specializes in animal cruelty offenses?

- ▶ **NO**
- ▶ Animal cruelty is a behavior, not a diagnosis
- ▶ Remember “the link” - animal cruelty offenders also likely to be committing other interpersonal crimes therefore need program proven effective with violent offenders (recognizing level of violence may vary)
- ▶ Choosing evidence-based program most important factor

References

- ▶ Andrews, D.A., & Bonta, J. (2010). Rehabilitating criminal justice policy and practice. *Psychology, Public Policy, and Law*, 16(1), 39-55.
- ▶ Hoge, Vincent, Guy. 2019. Bulletin 4: Prediction and Risk/Needs Assessment (Study Group on the Transitions between Juvenile Delinquency and Adult Crime) U. S. Department of Justice. Document Number 242934
- ▶ Jeglic, E.L., Maile, C. & Calkins-Mercado, C. (2011). Treatment of Offender Populations. In (Eds.) L. Gideon & H. Suny, In rethinking corrections, rehabilitation, reentry, and reintegration.
- ▶ Kemshall, H., Wilkinson, B., Kelly, G. & Hilder, S. (2015). What works in work with violence offenders: An overview. Serious Offending by Mobile European Criminals. www.somec-project.eu

References (cont'd)

- ▶ Kretschmar, J.M., Tossone, K., Butcher, F., & Marsh, B. (2018). Examining the impact of juvenile justice diversion programs for youth with behavioral health concerns on early adulthood recidivism. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 91, 168-176.
- ▶ Lipsey, M.W. (2009). The primary factors that characterize effective interventions with juvenile offenders: A meta-analytic overview. *An International Journal of Evidence-based Research, Policy, and Practice*, 4, 124-147.
- ▶ Papalia, N., Spivak, B., Daffern, M. & Ogloff, J.R. (2019). A meta-analytic review of the efficacy of psychological treatments for violence offenders and forensic mental health settings. *Clinical Psychology, Science and Practice*,
- ▶ Schwalbe, C.S., Gearing, R.E., MacKenzie, M.J., Brewer, K.B., & Ibrahim, R. (2012). A meta-analysis of experimental studies of diversion programs for juvenile offenders. *Clinical Psychology Review*, 32, 26-33.